



## Paratransit Advisory and Planning Committee Meeting Agenda Monday, May 21, 2018, 1:30 p.m.

Chair: Sylvia Stadmire      Staff Liaison: [Cathleen Sullivan](#),  
[Krystle Pasco](#),  
[Kate Lefkowitz](#)

Vice Chair: Sandra Johnson      Public Meeting  
Coordinator: [Angie Ayers](#)

### 1. Call to Order

### 2. Roll Call

### 3. Public Comment

### 4. Consent Calendar Page/Action

- |   |    |   |
|---|----|---|
| 4.1. <a href="#">Approve the March 26, 2018 PAPCO Meeting Minutes</a> | 1  | A |
| 4.2. <a href="#">Receive the FY 2017-18 PAPCO Meeting Calendar</a>    | 9  | I |
| 4.3. <a href="#">Receive the PAPCO Roster</a>                         | 11 | I |
| 4.4. <a href="#">Receive the Paratransit Outreach Calendar</a>        | 13 | I |

### 5. Paratransit Programs and Projects

- |   |    |   |
|---|----|---|
| 5.1. <a href="#">Approve the FY 2018-19 Paratransit Direct Local Distribution (DLD) Program Plans Recommendation</a>                      | 15 | A |
| 5.2. <a href="#">Review Updated Access Alameda Booklet</a>  | 43 | I |
| 5.3. 2018 Comprehensive Investment Plan (CIP) Paratransit Program Presentation – Bay Area Outreach and Recreation Program (BORP) (Verbal) |    | I |
| 5.4. <a href="#">Mobility Management – Mobility as a Service: Concept and Practice</a>  | 45 | I |

## 6. Committee and Transit Reports

- |  |    |  |
|--|----|--|
| 6.1. Independent Watchdog Committee (IWC) ( <i>Verbal</i> )                          |    |  |
| 6.2. East Bay Paratransit Service Review Advisory Committee (SRAC) ( <i>Verbal</i> ) |    |  |
| 6.3. <a href="#">Other ADA and Transit Advisory Committees</a>                       | 47 |  |

## 7. Member Reports

## 8. Staff Reports

## 9. Adjournment

Next PAPCO Meeting: June 25, 2018

Notes:

- All items on the agenda are subject to action and/or change by the Committee.
- To comment on an item not on the agenda (3-minute limit), submit a speaker card to the clerk.
- Call 510.208.7450 (Voice) or 1.800.855.7100 (TTY) five days in advance to request a sign-language interpreter.
- If information is needed in another language, contact 510.208.7400. Hard copies available only by request.
- Call 510.208.7400 48 hours in advance to request accommodation or assistance at this meeting.
- Meeting agendas and staff reports are available on the [website calendar](#).
- Alameda CTC is located near 12th St. Oakland City Center BART station and AC Transit bus lines. [Directions and parking information](#) are available online.



## Alameda CTC Schedule of Upcoming Meetings:

### Commission Chair

Supervisor Richard Valle, District 2

### Commission Vice Chair

Mayor Pauline Cutter,  
City of San Leandro

### AC Transit

Board President Elsa Ortiz

### Alameda County

Supervisor Scott Haggerty, District 1  
Supervisor Wilma Chan, District 3  
Supervisor Nate Miley, District 4  
Supervisor Keith Carson, District 5

### BART

Director Rebecca Saltzman

### City of Alameda

Mayor Trish Spencer

### City of Albany

Councilmember Peter Maass

### City of Berkeley

Councilmember Kriss Worthington

### City of Dublin

Mayor David Haubert

### City of Emeryville

Mayor John Bauters

### City of Fremont

Mayor Lily Mei

### City of Hayward

Mayor Barbara Halliday

### City of Livermore

Mayor John Marchand

### City of Newark

Councilmember Luis Freitas

### City of Oakland

Councilmember At-Large  
Rebecca Kaplan  
Councilmember Dan Kalb

### City of Piedmont

Vice Mayor Teddy Gray King

### City of Pleasanton

Mayor Jerry Thorne

### City of Union City

Mayor Carol Dutra-Vernaci

### Executive Director

Arthur L. Dao

Description	Date	Time
Alameda County Technical Advisory Committee (ACTAC)	June 7, 2018	1:30 p.m.
Finance and Administration Committee (FAC)	June 11, 2018	8:30 a.m.
I-680 Sunol Smart Carpool Lane Joint Powers Authority (I-680 JPA)		9:30 a.m.
I-580 Express Lane Policy Committee (I-580 PC)		10:00 a.m.
Planning, Policy and Legislation Committee (PPLC)		10:30 a.m.
Programs and Projects Committee (PPC)		12:00 p.m.
Transit Planning Committee (TPC)		1:30 p.m.
Independent Watchdog Committee (IWC)	July 9, 2018	5:30 p.m.
Paratransit Technical Advisory Committee (ParaTAC)	September 11, 2018	9:30 a.m.
Alameda CTC Commission Meeting	May 24, 2018	2:00 p.m.
Paratransit Advisory and Planning Committee (PAPCO)	May 21, 2018	1:30 p.m.
Bicycle and Pedestrian Community Advisory Committee (BPAC)	June 28, 2018	5:30 p.m.

All meetings are held at Alameda CTC offices located at 1111 Broadway, Suite 800, Oakland, CA 94607. Meeting materials, directions and parking information are all available on the [Alameda CTC website](http://www.AlamedaCTC.org).

***This page intentionally left blank***



Paratransit Advisory and Planning Committee  
Meeting Minutes  
Monday, March 26, 2018, 1:30 p.m.

4.1

1111 Broadway, Suite 800, Oakland, CA 94607

• 510.208.7400

• www.AlamedaCTC.org

**1. Call to Order**

**2. Roll Call**

Sylvia Stadmire, PAPCO Chair, called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m. A roll call was conducted and she confirmed that a quorum was achieved. All members were present with the exception of Bob Coomber, Christine Ross, Harriette Saunders, Will Scott, and Linda Smith.

**3. Public Comment**

There were no public comments.

**4. Approval of Consent Calendar**

- 4.1. Approve the November 20, 2017 PAPCO Meeting Minutes
- 4.2. Approve the February 26, 2018 Joint PAPCO and ParaTAC Meeting Minutes
- 4.3. Receive the FY 2017-18 PAPCO Meeting Calendar
- 4.4. Receive the PAPCO Roster
- 4.5. Receive the Paratransit Outreach Calendar

*Herb Hastings moved to approve this item. Esther Waltz seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

Yes: Stadmire, Johnson, Barranti, Costello, Hastings, Orr,  
Patterson, Rousey, Tamura, Waltz, Zukas

No: None

Abstain: Behrens, Bunn, Rivera-Hendrickson

Absent: Coomber, Ross, Saunders, Scott, Smith

**5. Paratransit Programs and Projects**

- 5.1. Receive the FY 2018-19 Paratransit Program Plan Review  
Overview and Complete Request for Subcommittee Volunteers

Krystle Pasco presented this item. She informed the Committee that the subcommittee process for reviewing next fiscal year's program plans has changed. The primary responsibility of the Subcommittee will be to review the distribution of Measure B and BB Direct Local Distribution (DLD) Paratransit funds totaling over \$24.4 million dollars. This process will incorporate a review of any unspent fund balances and notable trends in revenues and expenditures. The Committee may identify and recommend to the Alameda CTC alternative approaches that will improve special transportation services in Alameda County. The Program Plan Review meetings will take place on Monday, April 23, 2018 and Tuesday, April 24, 2018, from 1:00 to 3:30 p.m. PAPCO members were then asked to volunteer for appointment to the Paratransit Program Plan Review Subcommittees. Members who were interested were given a volunteer form to complete, and were told they would be notified of appointment via mail, email, or phone.

## **5.2. Receive the 2018 Comprehensive Investment Plan (2018 CIP) Paratransit Program Progress Report**

Naomi Armenta presented this item.

Yvonne Behrens asked why Eden I&R projections are low in every category except outreach. Ms. Armenta responded that Eden I&R is currently experiencing a data tracking problem but is working on the issue which should be resolved by next year.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson asked if data on programs that are questionable will be provided to the Committee or will the Committee only receive information during the next progress report in six months. Ms. Armenta stated they will continue to monitor the programs' progress and provide updates to the Committee as issues get resolved.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson asked about Senior Support Program of the Tri-Valley's percentage of service requests unfulfilled is low. Ms. Armenta stated that the two percent number is actually good. They want this number to be below 5 percent.

Peggy Patterson asked how Eden I&R computed the 29,616 figure for the number of individuals with access to mobility management support over the online finder. Ms. Armenta stated she will look into this.

Sylvia Stadmire asked if the Committee can expect to see better numbers in the next six months for Eden I&R's program. Ms. Armenta stated that is the expectation and staff will continue to monitor over the next few months.

Sylvia Stadmire asked why the City of Fremont shows actual numbers with no targets. Cathleen Sullivan said staff will get clarification and provide the Committee with the feedback.

**5.3. Discuss the 2020 CIP Paratransit Program Guidelines and Priorities**  
Cathleen Sullivan and Krystle Pasco presented this item.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson asked about same day transportation, which is not available in every part of Alameda County. Ms. Sullivan said that one priority for the 2020 CIP call for projects is to solicit applications to fill that gap.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson asked about Volunteer Driver Programs and if there are other types of funding that can be used to get these types of programs up and running. Ms. Sullivan said this discretionary funding is intended to fill that gap.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson asked if there is a way to get a number of how much funding we received from all of the funding sources, and what happens to money left over. Ms. Sullivan said that the funds roll over into the next CIP call for projects.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson asked if there was a way for the funding recipients to come to PAPCO meetings to address questions from the Committee. Ms. Pasco stated that as part of the funding agreement with Alameda CTC and the funding recipients, recipients are required to come to a PAPCO meeting and make a presentation at least once during the funding period.

Yvonne Behrens asked where local jurisdictions find the extra funding for these programs. Ms. Sullivan said many of the programs use their DLD funding. Also, some programs have reserve balances that can be used to fund these programs and some cities even dedicate general funding as matching funding.

#### **5.4. Review the Access Alameda Update**

Naomi Armenta presented this item.

Yvonne Behrens asked if the map will show the routes. Ms. Armenta stated that the map will show the different areas that are covered by the three different ADA providers.

Staff posed specific questions to PAPCO for feedback:

Michelle Rousey asked if there is a way to see this on the web and provide input. Ms. Armenta responded that yes, she can connect with Ms. Pasco and provide input that way.

Larry Bunn asked if the icons are different colors. Ms. Armenta said that the icons match the theme of the section being discussed/presented.

Yvonne Behrens asked if there will be lines separating information for the different cities as the information appears to blend together. Ms. Armenta stated that they will be working on adding contrast for easier viewing.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson suggested that Access Alameda should show the regional transfers between East Bay Paratransit and Wheels Dial-A-Ride. Ms. Armenta said we retained information on regional trips in the guide.

Ms. Armenta asked what portion of the current guide is most useful as a referencing guide.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson said the BART price between stations should be shown. Ms. Armenta said the guide is only intended to provide basic information on transit fares.



Sylvia Stadmire said she likes the quick guide with the page numbers. She also asked if the map will show page numbers. Ms. Armenta said that page numbers will appear on the map.

Carolyn Orr said she does not see the Access Alameda Guide at BART, churches, and senior centers. Ms. Armenta said to ask Ms. Pasco for copies of the guide to conduct outreach, or to provide her with suggestions on where to have the guides available.

Sylvia Stadmire stated that providing more information to seniors about what services 2-1-1 can provide would be helpful but there could be a problem with too much information on the 2-1-1 page in the guide. Ms. Armenta said perhaps a small section listing the questions that 2-1-1 can answer would be helpful.

Peggy Patterson suggested having a gathering to educate folks about the Access Alameda Guide to help users to navigate through the available services.

Ms. Armenta said staff will be conducting a photo shoot for potential photos for the Access Alameda guide on April 18, 2018 from 12:00 to 5:00 p.m. and she requested volunteers: Shawn Costello, Herb Hastings, Yvonne Behrens, Esther Waltz, Sylvia Stadmire, Michelle Rousey, Hale Zukas, Cimberly Tamura, and Larry Bunn expressed interest. Ms. Pasco said staff will take volunteers' names today and will let members know if they will be needed.

#### **5.5. Receive the City of Hayward Paratransit Program Report**

Krystle Pasco informed the committee that Dana Bailey is not able to attend the meeting today and this item will be rescheduled.

#### **5.6. Receive the City of Newark Paratransit Program Report**

David Zehnder presented this item. He provided background information on the paratransit program and noted that Satellite Affordable Housing Associates (SAHA) no longer administers the City of Newark's paratransit program. The City of Newark has established a partnership with the City of Fremont to administer

the paratransit program. David then provided a summary of services provided and a quick overview of the program's expenditures.

Esther Waltz asked if the Annual Health Fair will be changing from October to May. Mr. Zehnder clarified that Newark's fair is in October and Fremont's fair is in May. Ms. Pasco said that both events are listed on page 23 of the packet, the Paratransit Outreach Calendar.

#### **5.7. Mobility Management – Coordination: Community Models, Outcomes, and Lessons Learned**

Naomi Armenta presented this item.

### **6. Committee and Transit Reports**

#### **6.1. Independent Watchdog Committee (IWC)**

Herb Hastings reported that IWC last met in January and discussed volunteers needed for the IWC Annual Report subcommittee. The next meeting is in July.

#### **6.2. East Bay Paratransit Service Review Advisory Committee (SRAC)**

Naomi Armenta stated that SRAC approved their program plan at their last meeting. They also discussed the no-show policy and decided to update the policy to be a little more lenient for riders.

#### **6.3. Other ADA and Transit Advisory Committees**

Richard Weiner provided a brief update on San Mateo County's paratransit program. He reported that San Mateo County hosted the Regional Paratransit Coordinating Council (PCC) workshop last year and are interested in hosting it again in 2019.

### **7. Member Reports**

Sylvia Stadmire stated that she attended the Senior Injury Prevention Program Conference, which is a program that started at Highland Hospital through United Seniors of Oakland and Alameda County (USOAC). Ms. Stadmire also stated that she attended BART's Accessibility Task Force meeting with Herb Hastings and a national program meeting for Meals on Wheels. Ms. Stadmire announced a subsidized housing forum on March 29, 2018 from 12:00 to 1:30 p.m. at

the Castro Valley Moose Lodge. Lastly, she stated that she is currently working with BART staff on an application for a Lifeline Grant.

Larry Bunn attended an accessibility conference and noted that there are lots of new and exciting things coming up mobility-wise.

Shawn Costello announced that Don Biddle passed and the City of Dublin is looking for someone to fill his seat. Shawn noted that he applied for the position to fill the seat for the rest of this year.

Herb Hastings announced that the City Council meeting for the BART to Livermore Project is taking place on April 3, 2018 at the Dublin Library.

## **8. Staff Reports**

Krystle Pasco reminded the Committee that the Program Plan Review subcommittees are taking place on April 23 and April 24, 2018.

## **9. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 3:35 p.m. The next PAPCO meeting is scheduled for May 21, 2018 (one week earlier due to the Memorial Day holiday) at 1:30 p.m. at the Alameda CTC offices located at 1111 Broadway, Suite 800 in Oakland.

***This page intentionally left blank***



## FY 2017-18 Paratransit Advisory and Planning Committee (PAPCO) Meeting Calendar

1111 Broadway, Suite 800, Oakland, CA 94607

510.208.7400

[www.AlamedaCTC.org](http://www.AlamedaCTC.org)

PAPCO meetings occur on the fourth Monday of the month from 1:30-3:30 p.m. Joint PAPCO and ParaTAC meetings also occur on the fourth Monday of the month from 1:30-3:30 p.m. Meetings are held at the Alameda CTC offices in downtown Oakland. Note that meetings and items on this calendar are subject to change; refer to [www.AlamedaCTC.org](http://www.AlamedaCTC.org) for up-to-date information.

Categories	September 25, 2017 PAPCO	October 23, 2017 Joint	November 20, 2017 PAPCO	February 26, 2018 Joint	March 26, 2018 PAPCO	April 23-24, 2018 Subcommittees	May 21, 2018 PAPCO	June 25, 2018 PAPCO
<b>Planning and Policy</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>HDTs/WSBTS Programs and Same Day Accessible Transportation Options Update</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Volunteer Driver Programs Overview and Best Practices Presentation</li> <li>Panel and Discussion</li> </ul>	<p><b>One week earlier due to holiday.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Implementation Guidelines and Performance Measures Review and Approval</li> <li>Access Alameda Review and Discussion</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mobility Management and One-Call/One-Click Overview</li> <li>Guest Speaker: Arun Prem, San Diego FACT Presentation</li> <li>Panel and Discussion</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Discuss 2020 CIP Priorities and Guidelines</li> <li>Access Alameda Review</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Paratransit Program Plan Review Subcommittees</li> </ul>	<p><b>One week earlier due to holiday.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>FY 2018-19 Paratransit DLD Program Plans Recommendation</li> <li>Access Alameda Review</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Fiscal Year Wrap Up</li> </ul>
<b>Programs and Grants Review</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Gap Grant Cycle 5 Extension Progress Reports</li> <li>East Bay Paratransit Report</li> <li>Hayward Paratransit Report</li> <li>Newark Paratransit Report</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>San Leandro Paratransit Program Report</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2018 CIP Paratransit Progress Reports</li> <li>Newark Paratransit Report</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2018 CIP Paratransit Program Presentation – Bay Area Outreach and Recreation Program (BORG)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CRIL Accessible Van Share Program Presentation</li> </ul>
<b>Committee Development</b>					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program Plan Review Subcommittee Request for Volunteers</li> </ul>			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>FY 2018-19 PAPCO Officer Elections</li> <li>FY 2018-19 PAPCO Meeting Calendar Approval</li> </ul>

***This page intentionally left blank***

**Alameda County Transportation Commission  
Paratransit Advisory and Planning Committee  
Roster - Fiscal Year 2017-2018**

	<b>Title</b>	<b>Last</b>	<b>First</b>	<b>City</b>	<b>Appointed By</b>	<b>Term Began</b>	<b>Re apptmt.</b>	<b>Term Expires</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>Ms.</b>	<b>Stadmire, Chair</b>	<b>Sylvia J.</b>	<b>Oakland</b>	<b>Alameda County Supervisor Wilma Chan, D-3</b>	<b>Sep-07</b>	<b>Oct-16</b>	<b>Oct-18</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Ms.</b>	<b>Johnson, Vice Chair</b>	<b>Sandra</b>	<b>San Leandro</b>	<b>Alameda County Supervisor Nate Miley, D-4</b>	<b>Sep-10</b>	<b>Mar-17</b>	<b>Mar-19</b>
3	Mr.	Barranti	Kevin	Fremont	City of Fremont Mayor Lily Mei	Feb-16		<b>Feb-18</b>
4	Ms.	Behrens	Yvonne	Emeryville	City of Emeryville Mayor John Bauters	Mar-18		<b>Mar-20</b>
4	Mr.	Bunn	Larry	Union City	Union City Transit Steve Adams, Transit Manager	Jun-06	Jan-16	<b>Jan-18</b>
5	Mr.	Coomber	Robert	Livermore	City of Livermore Mayor John Marchand	May-17		<b>May-19</b>
6	Mr.	Costello	Shawn	Dublin	City of Dublin Mayor David Haubert	Sep-08	Jun-16	<b>Jun-18</b>
7	Mr.	Hastings	Herb	Dublin	Alameda County Supervisor Scott Haggerty, D-1	Mar-07	Jan-16	<b>Jan-18</b>
8	Rev.	Orr	Carolyn M.	Oakland	City of Oakland, Councilmember At-Large Rebecca Kaplan	Oct-05	Jan-14	<b>Jan-16</b>
9	Rev.	Patterson	Margaret	Albany	City of Albany Councilmember Peter Maass	Feb-18		<b>Feb-20</b>
10	Ms.	Rivera-Hendrickson	Carmen	Pleasanton	City of Pleasanton Mayor Jerry Thorne	Sep-09	Jun-16	<b>Jun-18</b>
11	Ms.	Ross	Christine	Hayward	Alameda County Supervisor Richard Valle, D-2	Oct-17		<b>Oct-19</b>
12	Ms.	Rousey	Michelle	Oakland	BART President Rebecca Saltzman	May-10	Jan-16	<b>Jan-18</b>

	<b>Title</b>	<b>Last</b>	<b>First</b>	<b>City</b>	<b>Appointed By</b>	<b>Term Began</b>	<b>Re apptmt.</b>	<b>Term Expires</b>
13	Ms.	Saunders	Harriette	Alameda	City of Alameda Mayor Trish Spencer	Jun-08	Jun-16	<b>Jun-18</b>
14	Mr.	Scott	Will	Berkeley	Alameda County Supervisor Keith Carson, D-5	Mar-10	Jun-16	<b>Jun-18</b>
15	Ms.	Smith	Linda	Berkeley	City of Berkeley Mayor Jesse Arreguin	Apr-16		<b>Apr-18</b>
16	Ms.	Tamura	Cimberly	San Leandro	City of San Leandro Mayor Pauline Cutter	Dec-15		<b>Dec-17</b>
17	Ms.	Waltz	Esther Ann	Livermore	LAVTA Executive Director Michael Tree	Feb-11	Jun-16	<b>Jun-18</b>
18	Mr.	Zukas	Hale	Berkeley	A. C. Transit Board President Elsa Ortiz	Aug-02	Feb-16	<b>Feb-18</b>
20		<b>Vacancy</b>			<b>City of Hayward Mayor Barbara Halliday</b>			
21		<b>Vacancy</b>			<b>City of Newark Councilmember Luis Freitas</b>			
22		<b>Vacancy</b>			<b>City of Piedmont Vice Mayor Teddy King</b>			
23		<b>Vacancy</b>			<b>City of Union City Mayor Carol Dutra-Vernaci</b>			





## FY 2017-18 Paratransit Outreach Calendar

4.4

1111 Broadway, Suite 800, Oakland, CA 94607

510.208.7400

www.AlamedaCTC.org

### Upcoming Events

Date	Event Name	Location	Time
5/25/18	USOAC Annual Convention**	St. Columba Church, 6401 San Pablo Avenue, Oakland, CA 94608	10:00 a.m. – 3:00 p.m.
May TBD	Open House and Resource Fair	Mastick Senior Center, 1155 Santa Clara Avenue, Alameda, CA 94501	3:00 p.m. – 6:00 p.m.

### Previous Events

Date	Event Name	Location	Time
9/21/17	Healthy Living Festival**	Oakland Zoo, 9777 Golf Links Road, Oakland, CA 94605	8:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.
10/3/17	Senior Health Faire	Silliman Activity Center, 6800 Mowry Avenue, Newark, CA 94560	9:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.
10/7/17	Senior Info Fair	Dublin Senior Center, 7600 Amador Valley Boulevard, Dublin, CA 94568	10:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.
3/16/18	Transit Fair**	Pleasanton Senior Center, 5353 Sunol Boulevard, Pleasanton, CA 94566	10:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.
3/24/18	Transition Information Faire**	College of Alameda, 555 Ralph Appezzato Memorial Parkway, Alameda, CA 94501	9:30 a.m. – 3:00 p.m.
4/25/18	Senior Wellness Fair	South Berkeley Senior Center, 2939 Ellis Street, Berkeley, CA 94703	10:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.
4/26/18	Senior Resource Fair	Albany Senior Center, 846 Masonic Avenue, Albany, CA 94706	10:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.

Date	Event Name	Location	Time
April TBD	Senior Resource Fair	San Leandro Senior Community Center, 13909 East 14th Street, San Leandro, CA 94578	10:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.
5/2/18	Older Americans Month Celebration	Oakland City Hall and Frank Ogawa Plaza, 1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA 94612	10:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.
5/3/18	Senior Health and Wellness Resource Fair**	Kenneth C. Aitken Senior and Community Center, 17800 Redwood Road, Castro Valley, CA 94546	9:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.
5/12/18	Age Friendly Health Expo**	Fremont Multi-Service Senior Center and Central Park, 40086 Paseo Padre Parkway, Fremont, CA 94538	9:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.

\*\*Alameda CTC's Paratransit Coordination Team will be distributing materials at an information table at events marked with asterisks (\*\*).

For more information about outreach events or to sign up to attend, please call Krystle Pasco at (510) 208-7467.



# Memorandum

5.1

1111 Broadway, Suite 800, Oakland, CA 94607

• 510.208.7400

• www.AlamedaCTC.org

**DATE:** May 14, 2018

**TO:** Paratransit Advisory and Planning Committee

**FROM:** Cathleen Sullivan, Principal Planner  
Krystle Pasco, Assistant Program Analyst

**SUBJECT:** FY 2018-19 Paratransit Direct Local Distribution (DLD) Program Plans

## Recommendation

Approve the Subcommittee's recommendations for FY 2018-19 Measure B and BB Paratransit DLD funding.

## Summary

Each year, agencies that receive Measure B and Measure BB Direct Local Distribution (DLD) funds for paratransit are provided with an estimate of annual sales tax revenue for the forthcoming fiscal year and are required to submit a paratransit program plan and budget of how they plan to spend the estimated revenue. The Alameda CTC's Paratransit Advisory and Planning Committee (PAPCO) Program Plan Review Subcommittees review and provide feedback to these agencies for the purpose of developing the best overall service in Alameda County by encouraging coordination, cost effectiveness, and consumer involvement. The Subcommittees make recommendations that may include full or conditional approval (which requires some type of follow up from programs, e.g. budget corrections or regular reports to PAPCO).

The PAPCO Program Plan Review Subcommittees for FY 2018-19 occurred on April 23<sup>rd</sup> and 24<sup>th</sup>, 2018.

At the May 21<sup>st</sup> meeting, PAPCO is asked to approve the Subcommittee's recommendations (Attachment A). The PAPCO recommendation will be available to the Alameda CTC Commission in their June meeting packet.

## **Background**

The 2000 Measure B Transportation Expenditure Plan (TEP) allocates 10.45% of net revenues and the 2014 Measure BB TEP allocates 10% of net revenues to affordable transportation for seniors and people with disabilities. Approximately 9% of net revenues from each TEP is distributed to agencies on a monthly basis as DLD funding for ADA-mandated services and City paratransit programs. The remaining funding is distributed as two-year grants on a discretionary basis. PAPCO is responsible for providing recommendations to the Commission related to funding for transportation for seniors and people with disabilities. This year, PAPCO is responsible for reviewing over \$24.4 million of Measure B and BB DLD funds that are passed through to paratransit programs.

The Program Plan Review Subcommittees will review and provide feedback to these agencies for the purpose of developing the best overall service in Alameda County by encouraging coordination, cost effectiveness, and consumer involvement. This process will also incorporate a review of any unspent fund balances and notable trends in revenues and expenditures.

Program Plan Review consists of five subcommittees held over two days, and members can be appointed to one or more of these subcommittees. There is one subcommittee for each of the four planning areas and a separate subcommittee for East Bay Paratransit. The subcommittees met on April 23<sup>rd</sup> and 24<sup>th</sup>, 2018 to review the applications. The subcommittee recommendations and meeting notes

are attached for reference (Attachment A) as well as a summary of the FY 2018-19 paratransit program plans (Attachment B).

**Fiscal Impact:** There is no fiscal impact associated with the requested action.

## **Attachments**

- A. April 23-24, 2018 PAPCO Program Plan Review Subcommittee Recommendations and Meeting Notes
- B. Summary of FY 2018-19 Paratransit Program Plans

***This page intentionally left blank***



# Paratransit Program Plan Review Subcommittee Meeting Notes Monday, April 23, 2018, 1:00 p.m.

5.1A

1111 Broadway, Suite 800, Oakland, CA 94607

510.208.7400

www.AlamedaCTC.org

## 1. Call to Order

Krystle Pasco called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m.

## 2. Welcome and Introductions

The meeting began with introductions.

Kevin Barranti and Larry Bunn left during item 7.3.

## 3. Program Plan Review Overview

Krystle Pasco provided an overview of the program plan review purpose and process at the beginning of each subcommittee. She stated that this year, PAPCO will be responsible for reviewing Measure B and BB Direct Local Distribution (DLD) funded paratransit programs totaling over \$24.4 million dollars. The Program Plan Review process will also incorporate a review of any unspent fund balances and notable trends in revenues and expenditures.

To prepare for participation in the Program Plan Review subcommittees, PAPCO members were provided with a booklet of reference material which contains the following:

- Program Plan Review Subcommittee Agendas
- PAPCO Instruction Memo
- General References and Background Information
- Comparative References

In addition, each subcommittee (East Bay Paratransit, North County, Central County, South County, and East County) had its own associated booklet which contains materials for each individual program:

- Staff Presentation
- Program Plan Application (narrative form and budget and vehicle spreadsheets)

PAPCO members were requested to review these documents thoroughly before the meeting and come prepared with questions.

#### **4. East Bay Paratransit Subcommittee**

##### **4.1. Public Comment**

A public comment was heard from Jonah Markowitz. He stated that he would like to know the number of personnel dealing with East Bay Paratransit (EBP) complaints. He inquired about the complaint process.

##### **4.2 Staff Summary**

Naomi Armenta presented the staff summary for this program and stated that staff recommends the program plan for full approval.

##### **4.3. East Bay Paratransit Presentation**

Mallory Nestor and Jay Jeter presented EBP's program plan.

##### **4.4. Questions and Answers**

Sylvia Stadmire stated that responses to complaints are not received from AC Transit and EBP in a timely manner. She also mentioned that she would like to see EBP's emergency preparedness documentation. Jay said that the documentation is never complete and it's continually updated.

Larry Bunn commented on the complaint process. He noted that he was left in Palo Alto by EBP for six hours and needed to take an Uber home. EBP's response time to complaints is an issue.

Herb Hastings wanted assurance that all of AC Transit DLD funds are used on EBP services. Ms. Nestor said that every dime of the funds are used for EBP.

Shawn Costello noted that EBP will not allow him to get on an EBP vehicle to the Dublin BART Station. If EBP supports the three quarters of a mile rule, then EBP should support that service. Jay Jeter said that the area Mr. Costello is addressing is supported by LAVTA. Mr. Jeter offered to reach out to LAVTA on his behalf. Mallory Nestor said that BART has arrangements with Tri-Delta and



other providers where AC Transit does not. She noted that BART needs to be included in this conversation.

Hale Zukas asked if EBP will be doing anything to get funding for Regional Centers. Jay Jeter responded that it's being explored and EBP staff will bring information to PAPCO when it's available.

Larry Bunn asked about the vans and buses that the provider is using. He suggested the provider review the vans and buses for the quality of the actual equipment. Jay Jeter said there is a new contract that's starting and it will require the provider to provide new buses over a course of time. He stated it may take about two years to replace the equipment. Mallory Nestor noted that the fleet is inspected twice a year. Jay Jeter said a financial penalty will apply if vehicles are not maintained well.

Kevin Barranti stated that EBP's complaint process needs an overhaul or needs to be seriously reviewed. He noted that he very rarely receives a timely response. The system is not working well. Jay Jeter noted that they have a video to assist in training the public about the complaint process. Krystle Pasco stated that the video would be a great tool to send out as a follow up to this discussion.

*Sylvia Stadmire moved to approve East Bay Paratransit's program plan in full. Herb Hastings seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

Yes: Barranti, Behrens, Bunn, Costello, Hastings, Patterson, Stadmire, Zukas

No: None

Abstain: Rivera-Hendrickson

Absent: None

## **5. South County Subcommittee**

### **5.1. Public Comments**

There were no comments from the public.

## **5.2. Staff Summary**

Richard Weiner presented the staff summary for the City of Fremont program and stated that staff recommends the program plan for full approval.

Richard Weiner presented the staff Summary for the City of Newark and stated that staff recommends conditional approval of the program plan pending further information on a planned increase in door-to-door cost per trip. Shawn Fong provided clarifying information regarding the door-to-door cost per trip. After reviewing the information, staff recommends full approval of the program plan.

Richard Weiner presented the staff summary for the City of Union City and stated that staff recommends the program plan for full approval.

## **5.3. City of Fremont Presentation**

Shawn Fong presented the City of Fremont program.

## **5.4. City of Newark**

David Zehnder and Shawn Fong presented the City of Newark program.

## **5.5. City of Union City**

Wilson Lee and Steve Adams presented the City of Union City program.

## **5.6. Questions and Answers**

Yvonne Behrens asked for clarification on why wheelchair accessible taxis are not permitted in the City of Union City. Shawn Fong said there aren't any wheelchair accessible taxi permits issued because taxi companies are losing drivers which decreases their fleet size. So they are not required to provide wheelchair accessible taxi service.

Yvonne Behrens asked why the City of Union City operators are not fully working forty hours a week. Steve Adams stated that it's

how the services are operated and a full time equivalent is someone working 35 to 40 hours a week.

Yvonne Behrens asked the City of Newark why staff expects the program registration to remain the same when it appears that the number of registrants are increasing. David Zehnder said that he should have said "we expect program registration to have a slight increase."

Yvonne Behrens commented that she is happy to see the City of Fremont working with the other cities.

Peggy Patterson asked the City of Union City why they are still using 80 years of age for the subsidized taxi service. Wilson Lee said there are limitations on budget and how it will affect the ridership and the number of vouchers. He noted that the age limit is for the taxi vouchers only.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson asked the City of Fremont when the pilot for the Transportation Network Company's will begin. Shawn Fong said that the plan is for the upcoming fiscal year. She said that the subsidy limit has not been set but it will look similar to the taxi program.

Herb Hastings asked the City of Union City about complaints from folks that request rides outside of their service area. Wilson Lee responded that EBP should provide those rides as it is in their service area.

Shawn Costello asked all presenters if they have programs that subsidize meals on wheels. Shawn Fong said the local meals on wheels program is operated by LIFE ElderCare. If someone is a homebound senior and needs a meal there is no fee. If someone is not qualified due to age LIFE ElderCare will charge a small share of the cost. If the person can't pay the fee LIFE ElderCare will assist in finding funding.

*Shawn Costello moved to approve the City of Fremont, City of Newark, and City of Union City program plans in full. Larry Bunn*

*seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

*Yes: Barranti, Behrens, Bunn, Costello, Hastings, Patterson, Rivera-Hendrickson, Stadmire, Zukas*

*No: None*

*Abstain: None*

*Absent: None*

## **6. Break**

## **7. East County Subcommittee**

### **7.1. Public Comment**

There were no public comments.

### **7.2. Staff Summary**

Naomi Armenta presented the staff summary for LAVTA's program and stated that staff recommends the program plan for full approval.

Naomi Armenta presented the staff summary for the City of Pleasanton and stated that staff recommends the program plan for full approval.

### **7.3. Livermore Amador Valley Transit Authority (LAVTA)**

Kadri Kulm and Tamara Edwards presented LAVTA's program.

### **7.4. City of Pleasanton**

Raymond Figueroa and Julie Parkinson presented the City of Pleasanton program.

### **7.5. Questions and Answers**

Peggy Patterson asked for clarifications on the cities' reserves. Krystle Pasco referred the Committee to the DLD's timely-use-of-fund policy which is in the references booklet.

Shawn Costello asked about LAVTA's same day service for wheelchair accessible vehicles. Kadri Klum said that LAVTA does

not have same day service. Tamara Edwards said the largest issue is having the drivers on standby and it's not currently financially feasible for LAVTA.

Yvonne Behrens asked the City of Pleasanton for clarification on 60 versus 70 years of age for residents to use their services. Raymond Figueroa stated that the age is 70 years and older for the door-to-door program and 60 years and older for the group trips.

Yvonne Behrens asked the City of Pleasanton why their door-to-door trips are more expensive than other City programs. Julie Parkinson said they are putting more resources in rolling out implementation and placing more focus on outreach and education to increase registration and ridership.

Yvonne Behrens asked LAVTA why their Dial-a-Ride service experienced a driver's shortage. Tamara Edwards said the fixed route service had the same problem and it was difficult to find people to fill the positions.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson asked LAVTA why the Go Dublin service is not included in the list of programs. Naomi Armenta stated that the program is not funded by Measure B or Measure BB so it does not need to be listed in the program plan.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson asked if LAVTA lost dispatchers. Tamara Edwards said that dispatchers are fully staffed and the call center has new reservationists.

Yvonne Behrens asked the City of Pleasanton about their outreach program and if they have multiple forms of outreach. Julie Parkinson stated that Pleasanton has many forms of outreach and they also conduct a program evaluation that is sent to registered Pleasanton Paratransit Service riders annually.

*Herb Hastings moved to approve the LAVTA and City of Pleasanton program plans in full. Sylvia Stadmire seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

Yes:       *Behrens, Costello, Hastings, Patterson,  
              Rivera-Hendrickson, Stadmire, Zukas*

No:         *None*

Abstain: *None*

Absent: *Barranti, Bunn*

## **8. Wrap Up**

Krystle Pasco asked if any Committee members or staff noticed any trends for the program plans that were reviewed today.

Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson commented that she is impressed with how the City of Fremont, City of Newark, and the City of Union City completed their packets and indicated that they were comprehensive. She noted that she liked the approach of presenting by planning areas instead of presenting programs one-by-one.

Peggy Patterson said that it was very helpful for new members to have the presenters grouped by geographic area.

Naomi Armenta said that positive responses were received from ParaTAC members throughout the planning process for the Program Plan Review Subcommittees.

## **9. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 3:40 p.m.



## 1. Call to Order

## 2. Welcome and Introductions

Krystle Pasco called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. A roll call was conducted and all members were present with the exception of Esther Waltz and Carolyn Orr.

### **Subsequent to the roll call:**

Esther Waltz arrived during item 4.3.

## 3. Program Plan Review Overview

Krystle Pasco provided an overview of the program plan review purpose and process at the beginning of each subcommittee. She stated that this year, PAPCO will be responsible for reviewing Measure B and BB Direct Local Distribution (DLD) funded paratransit programs totaling over \$24.4 million dollars. The Program Plan Review process will also incorporate a review of any unspent fund balances and notable trends in revenues and expenditures.

To prepare for participation in the Program Plan Review subcommittees, PAPCO members were provided with a booklet of reference material which contained the following:

- Program Plan Review Subcommittee Agendas
- PAPCO Instruction Memo
- General References and Background Information
- Comparative References

In addition, each subcommittee (East Bay Paratransit, North County, Central County, South County, and East County) had its own associated booklet which contains materials for each individual program:

- Staff Presentation

- Program Plan Application (narrative form, budget and vehicle spreadsheets)

PAPCO members were asked to review these documents thoroughly before the meeting and come prepared with questions.

#### **4. Central County Subcommittee**

##### **4.1. Public Comment**

There were no comments from the public.

##### **4.2. Staff Summary**

Naomi Armenta presented the staff summary for the City of Hayward. She stated that staff recommends conditional approval of the program plan due to the very late submission of the plan and failure to meet conditional approval for the current fiscal year (program plan was recommended for conditional approval with a quarterly report of programs presented to PAPCO). Staff is requesting that the City submit an explanation for the very late submission of the plan and failure to meet conditional approval for the current fiscal year by May 7, 2018. Additionally, staff is recommending conditional approval of the plan with two required reports to PAPCO in FY 2018-19, focused particularly on new program elements including the Transportation Network (TNC) Lyft pilot, taxi driver incentives, and accessible van share.

Naomi Armenta presented the staff summary for the City of San Leandro. She stated that staff recommends conditional approval of the program plan requiring a mid-year report to PAPCO due to the program's high reserves.

##### **4.3. City of Hayward Presentation**

Dana Bailey presented the City of Hayward program.

*Michelle Rousey moved to conditionally approve the City of Hayward program plan. Esther Waltz seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

Yes:       *Behrens, Bunn, Hastings, Patterson, Rousey, Stadmire, Tamura, Waltz*



No: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Orr

#### **4.4. City of San Leandro Presentation**

Ely Hwang presented the City of San Leandro program.

*Herb Hastings moved to conditionally approve the City of San Leandro program plan. Esther Waltz seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

Yes: Behrens, Bunn, Hastings, Patterson, Rousey, Stadmire,  
Tamura, Waltz

No: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Orr

#### **4.5. Questions and Answers**

Larry Bunn asked the City of Hayward for clarification on the accessible van share program with the Community Resources for Independent Living (CRIL). He wanted to know if they are available for paratransit. Dana Bailey said yes.

Larry Bunn asked the City of Hayward for clarification on the drivers' incentive. Dana Bailey stated that the incentive is for the taxi program.

Sylvia Stadmire asked the City of Hayward if they have plans for spending down their reserves. Dana Bailey said that Hayward's reserves will be used for capital expenses and may be used to partner with Lyft. If CRIL's accessible van share program can be expanded the reserves may be used to purchase additional vehicles.

Sylvia Stadmire noted the increase in cost per trip for the group trips program. Dana Bailey said that Hayward has seen a reduction in riders as well as longer trips, which may increase the cost. Ms. Bailey stated that they are currently looking at their

ridership and reviewing how the ridership can be modified in order to decrease the cost per trip.

Sylvia Stadmire commended the City of San Leandro for looking at ways to improve their program. She asked for clarification on the concierge program. Dana Bailey described how the Lyft Concierge Program works. She noted that instead of the client using a cell phone to hail a ride, they will call a central location and associated staff will arrange a ride for them.

Larry Bunn asked if the City of Hayward and the City of San Leandro's Lyft Concierge Program will be the same as Bell Transit through St. Mini Cab. Dana Bailey said the programs are different. She noted that the Concierge Program will work on the Lyft platform and use Lyft drivers. Ms. Bailey stated that she doesn't know if the Lyft Concierge Program will be accessible.

Larry Bunn asked the City of San Leandro why there was a drop in taxi voucher usage. Ely Hwang said that those who sign up for the Flex shuttle do so because of the taxi voucher program. She noted that there have been customer service issues with St. Mini Cab that caused a drop in taxi vouchers.

Michelle Rousey suggested to the City of Hayward and the City of San Leandro to work with CRIL to find out ways to enhance your services. Dana Bailey stated that they have been working very closely with CRIL and they will continue to do so.

Peggy Patterson asked the City of San Leandro for clarification on the number of residents that have disabilities and the number of seniors that reside in the jurisdiction.. Ely Hwang stated that San Leandro residents with disabilities make up 10.4% of the population. For residents over the age of 60, 28.5% of the population have disabilities.

Peggy Patterson asked if the City of Hayward vans are accessible. Dana Bailey said the two vans are accessible and are available to people that can use hand control.

Peggy Patterson asked the City of Hayward if they have a large Alzheimer day care in Hayward. Dana Bailey said yes.

## **5. Break**

## **6. North County Subcommittee**

### **6.1. Public Comments**

There were no comments from the public.

### **6.2. Staff Summary**

Richard Weiner presented the staff summary for the City of Alameda program. He stated that staff recommends conditional approval for the program plan pending further information on how the proposed capital investment is consistent with the objectives of the Alameda CTC Special Transportation for Seniors and People with Disabilities (Paratransit) Program which states that "programs should be designed to enhance quality of life for seniors and people with disabilities by offering accessible, affordable, and convenient transportation options to reach major medical facilities, grocery stores, and other important travel destinations to meet life needs." Staff is requesting that the program provide information on how seniors and people with disabilities will benefit from this capital investment.

Richard Weiner presented the staff summary for the City of Albany and stated that staff recommends the program plan for full approval.

Richard Weiner presented the staff summary for the City of Berkeley. He stated that staff recommends conditional approval for the program plan pending further information on potential shuttle (including additional details on the service plan and coordination with local fixed route provider) or other new transportation program(s).

Richard Weiner presented the staff summary for the City of Emeryville and stated that staff recommends the program plan for full approval.

Richard Weiner presented the staff summary for the City of Oakland and stated that staff recommends the program plan for full approval.

### **6.3. City of Alameda Presentation**

Victoria Williams and Gail Payne presented the City of Alameda program.

*Michelle Rousey moved to conditionally approve the City of Alameda program plan. Herb Hastings seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

Yes: Behrens, Bunn, Hastings, Patterson, Rousey, Stadmire, Tamura, Waltz, Zukas

No: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Orr

### **6.4. City of Albany Presentation**

Sid Schoenfeld presented the City of Albany program.

*Herb Hastings moved to approve the City of Albany program plan in full. Sylvia Stadmire seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

Yes: Behrens, Bunn, Hastings, Patterson, Rousey, Stadmire, Tamura, Waltz, Zukas

No: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Orr

### **6.5. City of Berkeley Presentation**

Tanya Bustamante and John Rudolph presented the City of Berkeley program.

*Michele Rousey moved to approve the City of Berkeley program plan in full. Esther Waltz seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

Yes: Behrens, Bunn, Hastings, Patterson, Rousey, Stadmire,  
Tamura, Waltz, Zukas  
No: None  
Abstain: None  
Absent: Orr

#### **6.6. City of Emeryville Presentation**

Brad Helfenberger presented the City of Emeryville program.

*Esther Waltz moved to approve the City of Emeryville program plan in full. Yvonne Behrens seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

Yes: Behrens, Bunn, Hastings, Patterson, Rousey, Stadmire,  
Tamura, Waltz, Zukas  
No: None  
Abstain: None  
Absent: Orr

#### **6.7. City of Oakland Presentation**

Hakeim McGee and Scott Means presented the City of Oakland program.

*Larry Bunn moved to approve the City of Oakland program plan in full. Sylvia Stadmire seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following votes:*

Yes: Behrens, Bunn, Hastings, Patterson, Rousey, Stadmire,  
Tamura, Waltz, Zukas  
No: None  
Abstain: None  
Absent: Orr

#### **6.8. Questions and Answers**

Yvonne Behrens asked the City of Alameda for clarification on the taxi subsidy and the amount a person may receive. Victoria

Williams said that each family can have \$50 for taxi subsidy per year.

Larry Bunn asked the City of Alameda for the cost of the taxi vouchers. Victoria Williams said that taxi vouchers for MRTIP is \$2.50 and it will take you home from anywhere in Alameda County. The premium program taxi voucher is \$1.50 for a \$5.00 voucher.

Esther Waltz asked for additional information on the Cross Alameda Trail project. Victoria Williams provided an overview of this project.

Peggy Patterson asked the City of Albany if they will add the ability to pick people up and take them to the senior centers. Sid Schoenfeld said that Albany is working on this and it's dependent upon the number of vehicles available and staffing.

Yvonne Behrens asked if there are limitations for the number of trips a person can take through the taxi program. Mr. Schoenfeld said no.

Hale Zukas asked the City of Emeryville to clarify why the cost per trip has gone down for the group trips program. Brad Helfenberger said the majority of Alameda CTC funds were used to hire outside bus companies. He said that Emeryville is hiring fewer outside buses which caused the cost per trip to decrease.

Yvonne Behrens asked the City of Emeryville to clarify the six one-way rides per month. Brad Helfenberger stated that that is referring to the 8-To-Go program and riders can use the shuttle up to six times per week, which is three round trips per week.

Hale Zukas asked all North County cities about how they educate the riders to ride the bus and BART i.e. travel training. Victoria Williams said that Alameda partners with the Center for Independent Living (CIL) to do travel training twice a year. Tanya Bustamante said that Berkeley's travel training program will be implemented next fiscal year. Brad Helfenberger said that Emeryville's senior center provides travel training through CIL. Sid

Schoenfeld said that Albany offered travel training in the past and will work on scheduling trainings in the future. Hakiem McGee said that Oakland will have conversations with the United Seniors of Oakland and Alameda County (USOAC) about their travel training program and see if a partnership is possible. Mr. McGee said they are also looking at having workshops with their senior centers to offer travel training.

Larry Bunn asked the City of Oakland to clarify when Oakland began the process of having the taxi driver's charge 10% for processing vouchers. Hakiem McGee said that it began on July 1, 2017.

Herb Hasting asked the City of Alameda why the increase was high for the shuttle program's cost per trip. Victoria Williams said the shuttle costs increased because they added a second vehicle in October 31, 2017. She said that the goal is to get the price down to \$20 per trip.

Herb Hasting asked the City of Alameda why the taxi program's cost per trip increased from \$18 to \$33. Victoria Williams said they did not receive any responses on their Request for Proposal (RFP). She stated that TNCs have had an impact on their taxi programs.

Herb Hastings asked the City of Albany who the governing body is for the paratransit program. Sid Schoenfeld said the City Council.

Herb Hastings asked the City of Albany how late the shuttle runs. Sid Schoenfeld said it depends on the pace of each shopper.

Herb Hastings asked why Oakland doesn't have data for the number of trips provided to a consumer using a mobility device. Naomi Armenta said that not all programs can track this data and Alameda CTC noted that in the reports.

Michelle Rousey asked the City of Oakland about the status of same day taxi services or other services for wheelchair and mobility devices. Hakiem McGee said the City of Oakland created a Department of Transportation and taxi oversight is rolled under that department. The Oakland Department of

Transportation drafted an RFP for these service and has a meeting scheduled at City Hall on Monday, May 21, 2018 from 5:30 p.m. to 7:30 p.m. to discuss this issue.

Larry Bunn asked the City of Alameda to identify their current taxi vendor. Victoria Williams said its First American and they have accessible taxi cabs that are not same day. She noted that the shuttle is 100% accessible and is same day.

Yvonne Behrens asked the City of Oakland if they have any indication from the customer satisfaction survey responses since the results are not available until May. Hakeim McGee said the responses are generally positive and overall folks are very satisfied with the provision of services.

Yvonne Behrens asked the City of Emeryville to clarify their surveys. Brad Helfenberger said that every trip goer is issued an itinerary, which includes a comment section. They encourage everyone to complete the comments section and return the survey to the trip escort. Emeryville staff will then follow up as appropriate.

Yvonne Behrens asked the City of Berkeley how are they able to provide all identified trips with two vans. Tanya Bustamante stated that part of the presentation was talking specifically about the transportation between their senior centers.

Yvonne Behrens asked the City of Albany if they are considering decreasing the age from 80 years to 70 years for residents to access services. Sid Schoenfeld said yes.

## **7. Wrap Up**

Krystle Pasco asked if any Committee members or staff noticed any trends for the program plans that were reviewed today.

Sylvia Stadmire said that she liked the new format for the Program Plan Review subcommittees.

Peggy Patterson commented that she noticed the trend toward moving the age for taxi services toward 70 and she encouraged cities



that have services available to individuals 80 years or older to lower the age limit.

Yvonne Behrens commended the movement regarding improving accessibility to help people that have been bound to their homes.

## **8. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 3:10 p.m.

***This page intentionally left blank***

## Summary of FY 2018-19 Measure B and BB Paratransit Direct Local Distribution (DLD) Program Plans

Program	Program Components (includes grant programs)	FY 2018-19 MB/BB Paratransit DLD Funding	Other Funding*	Total Program Cost	Number of Trips
Alameda	Taxi, Accessible Fixed-Route Shuttle, Group Trips, Scholarship, Capital	\$975,109	\$18,000	\$993,109	11,600
Albany	Taxi, Group Trips (Recreation and Hiking Day Trips, Pick Up & Go! Shopping and Senior Center Trips)	\$87,708	\$11,000	\$98,708	6,650
Berkeley	Taxi Program (regular and High Need Medical), City-based Specialized Van, Accessible Fixed-Route Shuttle (proposal), Scholarship	\$800,000	\$222,000	\$1,022,000	16,600
Emeryville	Taxi, Group Trips, Scholarship, City-based Door-to-Door (8-To-Go), Meal Delivery	\$122,100	\$183,375	\$305,475	8,200
Fremont	City-based Door-to-Door, Tri-City Taxi, TNC Pilot Project, Volunteer Driver programs, Group Trips, Tri-City Mobility, Meal Delivery, Management/Travel Training	\$1,836,849	\$80,000	\$1,836,849	37,650

Program	Program Components (includes grant programs)	FY 2018-19 MB/BB Paratransit DLD Funding	Other Funding*	Total Program Cost	Number of Trips
Hayward	Taxi (and Lyft pilot with 2-1-1), City-based Specialized Van (ASEB and CRIL), Group Trips, Travel Training (CRIL), Volunteer Driver (LIFE Eldercare), Scholarship/Subsidized Fare, Meal Delivery	\$1,655,000	\$41,300	\$1,696,300	19,350
Newark	City-based Door-to-Door, Meal Delivery, Tri-City Taxi, Volunteer Driver programs, Mobility Management/Travel Training	\$247,000	\$0	\$247,000	8,019
Oakland	Taxi (regular, Grocery Return Improvement Program, Taxi Up & Go), City-based Door-to-Door (BACS), City-based Specialized Van, Group Trips	\$2,676,940	\$82,355	\$2,759,295	56,000
Pleasanton	City-based Door-to-Door, ADA-mandated paratransit for Pleasanton and Sunol residents (coordinates with LAVTA), Scholarship, Para-Taxi, Group Trips	\$362,215	\$519,483	\$881,698	9,440

Program	Program Components (includes grant programs)	FY 2018-19 MB/BB Paratransit DLD Funding	Other Funding*	Total Program Cost	Number of Trips
San Leandro	Accessible Fixed-Route Shuttle, Taxi, Volunteer Driver program	\$846,147	\$7,059	\$853,206	21,286
LAVTA	ADA-mandated paratransit (coordinates with Pleasanton for Pleasanton and Sunol residents), Para-Taxi	\$484,945	\$2,042,578	\$2,527,523	58,000
Union City	ADA-mandated paratransit, Tri-City Taxi, Volunteer Driver programs, Mobility Management/Travel Training	\$545,897	\$519,247	\$1,065,144	24,280
EBP-AC Transit	ADA-mandated paratransit	\$14,575,996	\$15,080,713	\$29,656,709	746,981
EBP-BART		\$4,050,687	\$9,627,733	\$13,678,420	
Total		\$29,266,593	\$28,434,843	\$57,621,436	1,024,056

\* Other funding includes Measure B/BB paratransit discretionary grant, fares, reserves, General Fund, etc.

***This page intentionally left blank***



# Memorandum

5.2

1111 Broadway, Suite 800, Oakland, CA 94607

• 510.208.7400

• www.AlamedaCTC.org

**DATE:** May 14, 2018

**TO:** Paratransit Advisory and Planning Committee

**FROM:** Cathleen Sullivan, Principal Planner  
Krystle Pasco, Assistant Program Analyst

**SUBJECT:** Review Updated Access Alameda Booklet

## Recommendation

Provide input on mock-up of new Access Alameda booklet.

## Summary

During FY 2017-18 Alameda CTC staff has been working with the Paratransit Advisory and Planning Committee (PAPCO), the Paratransit Technical Advisory Committee (ParaTAC), and stakeholders to update the Access Alameda booklet and website. At the May 21<sup>st</sup> PAPCO meeting, members will have an opportunity to review a mock-up of an updated booklet and provide comments and corrections. Final feedback and edits should be provided by May 25<sup>th</sup>.

## Major Changes

The major changes that have been made to the booklet are:

- Changed Overview section into How to Use Guide
  - Tools to assist in use of Guide have replaced table of contents at the start of the booklet
  - Incorporated travel training and volunteer driver programs into How to Use Guide

- First section of guide is a new section titled, “Services in Your Community” which has a 2-page spread for each City which includes information on most modes offered there, to provide a “one-stop-shop” for each community
- Guide is more visual, with icons, maps, and/or expanded “quick guides”
- 2-1-1 has more prominence in guide
- Included more references to Measure BB
- Shortened City Programs to descriptions and added reference to “Services in Your Community” section
- Made edits to program and contact information as needed to reflect changes since prior guide
- Updated pictures
- Moved relevant items from Mobility Management to other sections to make them more user-friendly

### ***Next Steps***

After getting PAPCO input, staff will finalize the guide and move into translation and printing. New Access Alameda booklets should be available during summer 2018. The Access Alameda website is in the process of being updated and will go live during summer 2018; changes will be based on changes to the Access Alameda guide.

**Fiscal Impact:** There is no fiscal impact associated with the requested action.



# Mobility as a Service: Concept and Practice



In recent years, the planning and delivery of community transportation have seen their own “industrial revolution,” except at a much quicker pace than was ever seen in the 18th/19th century version. The field has experienced the advent of sophisticated algorithms for scheduling routes and trips, GIS-based tracking and monitoring of vehicles, apps that allow customers to more directly interface with services and receive minute-by-minute service updates, and now even automated operations of vehicles. Simultaneously, and largely enabled by these technological advances, the range of modes for moving about the community has rapidly evolved. To the traditional choices of travel by private automobile, bus, taxi, and train, we have now added bikeshare, carshare, on-demand carpooling and shuttling, vanpooling, and transportation network companies.

Most of these advances have been added to the community transportation menu piecemeal, leaving transportation planners and operators to figure out how to integrate them into existing options. The focus of this brief is on one promising strategy for giving customers a single interface through which they can access any and all transportation services in their community: Mobility as a Service (MaaS).

### **What is Mobility as a Service?**

MaaS is essentially the next step in the progression from isolated agency-by-agency information and operations to a one-call/one-click/one-pay transportation network. The philosophy behind MaaS is to direct people to their most appropriate mobility options, in real time, through a single, unified trip planning and payment application.

This term is frequently confused and misused, and it is important to understand what it means.

[ERTICO](#), Europe’s Intelligent Transportation Systems partnership, describes MaaS as “putting users, both travelers and goods, at the core of transport services, offering them tailor-made mobility solutions based on their individual needs. This means that, for the first time, easy access to the most appropriate transport mode or service will be included in a bundle of flexible travel service options for end users.”

For a visual understanding of MaaS, [this video](#) provides a great demonstration.

In communities with an array of transportation options, such as large urban areas, embracing the MaaS model provides maximum flexibility to customers for deciding among travel modes, schedules, and price points. In doing so, travelers become better consumers, learning about all alternatives to driving alone and more precisely identifying the mode that suits them best for a particular trip, without their having to commit to that mode for other trips. Having this type of centralized information and choice can also greatly improve access for travelers with mobility challenges, allowing them to understand the array of choices before them and decide on the most appropriate.

Benefits accrue at the system level from MaaS as well: demand is more efficiently spread across modes, communities are better able to identify gaps where travel choices are still sparse, and partnerships to fill gaps are encouraged. To be more proactive, providers can even actively determine areas of unmet demand by tracking searches for origins and destinations and comparing to service availability.

This can be particularly helpful in small urban and rural communities, which lack the varied menu of options seen in urban areas that are so crucial to a person’s access to work or health care. MaaS would allow mobility managers in social service and public agencies to identify service gaps and opportunities to incorporate new providers into the network.

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA TRANSIT DISTRICT  
ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE**

**Minutes**

February 22, 2018

**1. Self-Introductions of Members, Staff and Guests**

**Members:**

Janet Abelson  
Randall Glock  
Janice Armigo Brown  
Peter Crockwell  
Don Queen  
Hale Zukas  
Clarence Fischer – (ABSENT)  
Gerry Newell  
Herb Hastings  
Alan Smith  
Larry Bunn – (ABSENT)  
Roland Wong  
Esperanza Diaz-Alvarez  
Debby Leung – (ABSENT)  
Catherine Callahan  
Valerie Buell  
Chris Mullin

**BART Staff present:** Bob Franklin, Elena VanLoo

**Directors, Speaker(s), Guest Staff, and Guests of the Public:**

Scott Smith (BART Staff)  
Isaac Lim (BART Staff)  
Mussie Gebre (Guest)  
Christina Lasson (Guest)  
Nicole Bouslog (Guest)  
Irma Lujan (Guest)  
Justina Victoriano (Guest)  
Emily Witkin (Guest)  
Arnold Bellinger (Guest)  
Jennifer Mantle (ASL Interpreter)  
Elliot Helman (ASL Interpreter)  
Janice Dispo (Stenographer)

## **2. Public Comments**

[No public comments.]

## **3. Approval of January 25, 2018 Meeting Minutes**

[Minutes to be reviewed at next meeting.]

## **4. Downtown Berkeley BART Station Project - Update**

After the update given by Scott Smith, members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had.

Members requested for a tour of the station.

## **5. Public Announcements at BART Stations – Update**

After the update given by Isaac Lim, members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had.

A long discussion was held.

Members were invited to share any additional questions they had via e-mail.

## **6. Draft BART Accessibility Task Force Strategic Goals for 2018**

A long discussion was held wherein members were able to make comments and suggest changes to the list of goals.

## **7. Chairperson Announcements**

The Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA) has prepared Environmental Impact Reports (EIR), in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

Randall Glock gave an overview of his experience attending the BART Board Retreat.

## **8. Staff Announcements**

[No staff announcements.]

## **9. Member Announcements**

[No member announcements.]

## **10. Future Agenda Topics**

- Update of Fleet of the Future survey
- Discussion on topics such as cleanliness of elevators, lighting at stations, and bond oversight
- Inviting a line supervisor to attend a BATF meeting
- Update on eBART

## **11. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned to the next regularly scheduled meeting of **Thursday, March 22, 2018, at 2:00 p.m., at 1750 Broadway, Oakland, California.**

(The meeting adjourned at 4:05 p.m.)

***This page intentionally left blank***

**Service Review Advisory Committee (SRAC)  
Meeting Minutes from March 6, 2018**

**1. Call to order**

Chair Brillinger called the meeting to order at 12:30 pm at 1750 Broadway, Oakland Community Room 1st Floor.

**2. Roll Call and Introduction of Guests**

**SRAC Members Present:**

Arnold Brillinger, Chair	Don Queen, Vice-Chair
Janet Abelson	Yvonne Dunbar
Letitia Tumaneng	Mary Seib
Peter Crockwell	Janet Bilbas

**SRAC Absent Members:**

Harriette Saunders	Robert L. Kearney, Jr
Jay Butterfield	Micheal Pope
Shawn Fong	Cimberly Tamura

**Staff Present:**

Jay Jeter, General Manager-Broker/Transdev  
Cynthia Lopez, Assistant General Manager-Broker/Transdev  
Dora Ramirez, Contract Compliance Supervisor-Broker/Trandev  
Deneen VanHook, Temporary Secretary-Broker/Transdev  
Lauri Shay, Certification Manager-Broker/Transdev  
Pamela Lee-Kelly, Operations Supervisor-Broker/Transdev

Laura Timothy, Manager of Access and accessible Services-  
BART  
Mallory Nestor-Brush Accessible Services Manager-AC Transit

**Guest:**

Raquel Rodriguez, A-Paratransit (arrived 12:44)

**3. Review of Orientation and Security Considerations:**

Cynthia Lopez provided a briefing on emergency and evacuation procedures of the Community Room.

**4. Nov 7th meeting minutes approved by SRAC committee members.**

**5. Introduction of Lauri Shay Certification Manager for Transdev:**

Jay Jeter Introduced Lauri to all present with accolades and great hopes for the future. Lauri expressed that she is excited to join the EBPT team and looks forward to bringing her insight and viewpoint to the company.

**6. Review Measure B/Measure BB:**

Mallory Brush gave an overview of both Measures and that this will be the 18th application filing of each. She explained that there are few changes to the measures. The most significant being funding. The breakdown will include an adjustment due to technological logistic improvements with providers such as



Uber, Lyft and Sidecar coming in the future. There is to also be an installment of a new phone system late April. The announcement of the start of a new 5-year contract between the consortium (AC Transit/Bart) and Transdev as broker. Starting July 1st 2018-2023. She also gave statistics as to accident levels. There were 51 accidents with no major injuries. Don Queen and Janet Abelson asked to clarify no major injuries. Mallory said meaning no transport to hospital. Motion to approve staff recommendation was tendered by Don Queen and seconded by Janet Abelson. All were in favor Motion was carried.

## **7. Current No-Show policy, FTA comments and Recommendations:**

Review of current policy by Laura Timothy. There were three concerns during the FTA audit that were addressed. The first was 6 no-shows may not indicate a pattern. Recommendation shows limits to be effective as there have only been 30 suspensions in three years. Keeping the current limits in place was accepted. Second, suspensions lasting longer than thirty days may not be reasonable. The recommendation was to change policy longest period of suspension not to exceed 30 days. Third, policy should not be to cancel a return trip without an indication from the rider. Recommendation, no change is necessary as this is current policy. There were SRAC suggestions as well. Letitia asked if Social and Case workers were aware of or educated about no-show policy. These individuals are responsible for a large number of riders. She suggested training and notification in writing. Placing additional information on the hold message regarding no-show policy was suggested. Education of policy on an interview level with applicants was also suggested. Motion to approve recommendations was tendered by Janet Abelson and

seconded by Mary Seib. All were in favor and motion was carried.

**8. Item was pulled by Mallory Nestor-Brush.**

**9. Broker Report:**

Jay Jeter presented updates on prior concerns. Progress in on time performance due to the increase in drivers as well as dispatch additions to staff. Call center has also seen growth with new agents that are being trained to possibly transition to dispatch increasing the effectiveness of dispatch and call center. Thanks to Estephania Castillo for the additional training provided to call center agents. A driver assigned to specific geographic location has made a positive mark in on time performance as well. Don Queen suggested that drivers are allowed to make changes to the route on an as needed basis due to traffic and road closures. Jay stated that this is possible and already policy as long as drivers communicate the change to dispatch that without that communication on time performance will suffer. Letitia brought out an incident restricting access to the Oracle Arena for drivers. Laura will reach out to Arena administration. Don Queen asked for clarification of Zones assigned to drivers. Jay gave Oakland-Hayward  
San Francisco  
Richmond-Maze  
San Leandro-Fremont as the zones assigned.

**10. Report from SRAC Members:**

Members had no report for this section.

# **11. Adjournment and Announcement of next SRAC Meeting:**

The meeting adjourned and the next SRAC meeting is on Tuesday May 1st, 2018 at 12:30pm in the community room at 1750 Broadway, Oakland.

Minutes prepared by Deneen VanHook and Cynthia Lopez

***This page intentionally left blank***

**LIVERMORE AMADOR VALLEY TRANSIT AUTHORITY**  
**1362 Rutan Court, Suite 100**  
**Livermore, CA 94551**

**WHEELS Accessible Advisory Committee**

**DATE:** Wednesday, March 7, 2018

**PLACE:** Dublin Library- Program Room  
 200 Civic Plaza, Dublin, CA 94568

**TIME:** 1:00 p.m.

**DRAFT MINUTES**

**1. Call to Order**

The WAAC Chair Herb Hastings called the meeting to order at 1:02 pm.

**Members Present:**

Russ Riley	City of Livermore
Connie Mack	City of Dublin
Shawn Costello	City of Dublin
Sue Tuite	City of Pleasanton – Alternate
Herb Hastings	County of Alameda
Judy LaMarre	County of Alameda - Alternate
Amy Mauldin	Social Services Member
Raymond Figueroa	Social Services Member
Esther Waltz	PAPCO

**Staff Present:**

Michael Tree	LAVTA
Kadri Kulm	LAVTA
Tamara Edwards	LAVTA
Jonathan Steketee	MTM
Lindsay Bookhammer	MTM
Christian Pereira	MV Transit

**Guests:**

Jeff Jacobsen	Dial-A-Ride rider
---------------	-------------------

**2. Citizens' Forum: An opportunity for members of the audience to comment on a subject not listed on the agenda (under state law, no action may be taken at this meeting)**

WAAC held a 2-minute silence in memory of LAVTA board member Don Biddle, who recently passed away. Shawn Costello noted that the Dublin seat is now available.

Esther Waltz updated the committee that her husband Richard has been sick, but he is getting better.

**3. Minutes of the January 3, 2018 meetings of the Committee**

Approved.

Costello/Waltz

**4. WAAC Recruitment for FY18/19**

Staff informed the committee that the applications for the 2-year terms starting on July 2018 are due on April 20, 2018. There are nine current members/alternates whose terms are expiring, all of whom are encouraged to re-apply.

**5. Paratransit Plan Submittal**

Staff presented the draft Annual Program Submittal for ACTC Measure B and BB funding to the committee. The plan to ACTC is due March 23<sup>rd</sup> and the members are encouraged to submit any feedback they have to staff before the due date.

**8. Dial-A-Ride Passenger Satisfaction Survey**

Staff presented the results of the latest satisfaction survey, which was conducted in December 2017 and January 2018. This time around 257 surveys were completed (compared to 150 in 2016 and 100 in 2015), including 206 phone surveys and 51 online surveys. Previously only phone survey has been administered. The satisfaction scores have decreased when comparing them to the results the year prior, mostly in the on time aspect of the service.

Shawn Costello recommended that staff include a question "Do you feel safe in the vehicle as a wheelchair rider?" next time around. Staff is planning on incorporating Shawn's question.

**9. FY 2017/18 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter Operations Report**

Staff informed the committee that the number of passengers, the number of total trips and on-time-performance have all decreased when comparing these figures to the same three months a year prior.

## **9. PAPCO Report**

Esther talked to the group about what was discussed at the latest PAPCO meeting.

## **8. Dial-A-Ride Issues – Suggestions for Changes**

Jeff Jacobson asked about the “Nite to Shine” event that took place on February 9<sup>th</sup> as several passengers’ rides were late. Jonathan Steketee said that during drop off to the event, the event did not have a coordinated parking plan and MTM’s drivers were stuck in about 45 min to an hour of standstill traffic getting into the event. The delay in being able to get into the event resulted in late pick ups for several riders. For departure from the event, clients all had staggered pick up times that were negotiated. However, none of the clients came out of the event at their scheduled times. Instead, clients came out in mass at the end of the event. MTM had drivers were standing by at the time of the pick ups, but, the event security would not allow the drivers to come in and find the clients. . When all the clients came out at the same time, MTM did not have capacity to pick up all the clients at the same time. However, we coordinated with the care givers, who took Uber instead of the rides. In the future, when large events like “Nite to Shine” occur, MTM will speak to the organizers and coordinate a pick up and drop off plan to ensure that clients arrive and depart in a timely manner.

Shawn Costello said that he does not like it when the reservations department is negotiating trip pick-up times and he can’t get the time he wants.

Sue Tuite said that not all drivers wear id badges. Jonathan and Kadri will follow up.

Herb Hastings said that he was on the phone for 20 minutes on Friday, March 2<sup>nd</sup>. Jonathan Steketee provided the group with the reservations line call hold statistics and said that last Friday was bad because their scheduling system crashed causing also a delay on phone pick-ups. Herb recommended that the reservations call could be directed to MTM’s Livermore staff after a five or so minutes of holding. Jonathan to look into it to see how feasible that would be. Herb also mentioned that the driver who came to pick him up on the day of the meeting was new and was waiting at the wrong side of the street.

Judy LaMarre said that the driver was half way down the street for her pick up on the day of the meeting. Jonathan Steketee replied that the pick-up details can be put into the scheduling software so that the scheduler/dispatchers/drivers can see them.

## **9. Fixed Route Issues – Suggestions for Changes**

Judy LaMarre stated that she missed the route 14 going toward BART on Sunday, March 4<sup>th</sup> at 10:56am. Staff said there was a marathon in Livermore on that day, which affected the bus service. Judy added that on March 6<sup>th</sup> the route 14 didn't want to stop. She would also like to see more seating at the bus stops.

Shawn Costello mentioned he "caught the back bumper" on R30 and didn't make it to the bus.

Esther Waltz said that some R buses have a charger for the phone, but some do not. Christian Pereira noted that they have commissioned the new 2017 buses and the older version buses are coming off the roads.

Herb Hastings said that his transit app showed routes 30R and 10 simultaneously at the Dublin Civic Center stop, which is not correct because 10 is not supposed to be there. Staff is following up with the IT department. Shawn also asked about the bus stop at the mall, which has a non-working sign. Staff said that this stop sign is solar-powered and often in the tree shade, which is why it's not always working. A possible solution would be hardwiring the sign, but need to talk to the mall owner first.

## **10. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 2:31pm. The next meeting is May 2<sup>nd</sup> at 3:30pm at the Dublin Library Program Room.



**ATTACHMENT 1  
DRAFT MINUTES  
REGULAR MEETING OF THE AC TRANSIT  
ACCESSIBILITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE (AAC)  
MARCH 13, 2018**

The meeting was called to order at 1:04 p.m.

**1. Roll Call and Introduction of Members and Guests**

**AAC members present:**

Janet Abelson	Chonita Chew
Mary Clutts	Shirley Cressey
Pam Fadem	Maureen Gilhooly (1:18)
Don Queen	James Robson, Chair
Will Scott (1:07)	Tanya Washington
Barbara Williams	Hale Zukas (1:13)

**AAC members absent:**

Saleem Shākir Gilmore (excused)      Jim Gonsalves (excused)

**Staff:**      Tammy Kylo, Administrative Coordinator  
                  Kim Ridgeway, Accessible Services Specialist  
                  Mallory Nestor-Brush, Accessible Services Manager  
                  Linda Nemeroff, District Secretary  
                  Michael Eshleman, Service Planning Manager  
                  Estee Sepulveda, Legislative Affairs & Community Relations  
                  Claudia Burgos, Director of Legislative Affairs & Community Relations

**Guests:**      H. E. Christian Peeples, Board President  
                  Chris Mullin

The Committee welcomed new member Maureen Gilhooly, who introduced herself and gave some background about her experience with public transportation, including being an instructor for children with special needs.

**2. Order of Agenda**

The order of agenda was approved.

**3. Approval of Minutes**

MOTION: Cressey/Washington approved the February 13, 2018 AAC meeting minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

AYES – 7: Cressey, Queen, Robson, Scott, Washington, Williams, Zukas

ABSTENTIONS –4: Abelson, Chew, Clutts, Gilhooly

ABSENT – 3: Fadem, Gilmore, Gonsalves

#### **4. Completion of Conflict of Interest Form 700**

Linda Nemeroff, District Secretary, provided assistance to Committee members in completing the Conflict of Interest 700 Form. Members who arrived late to the meeting were asked to complete their forms at the conclusion of the meeting.

#### **5. Review of March Service Changes**

Michael Eshleman, Service Planning Manager, reported the following as part of the March service changes to be implemented on March 18, 2018. The March sign-up is generally reserved for making minor adjustments to service based on feedback received after the August and December sign-ups. This sign-up has several small adjustments to running times and schedules to improve reliability. The following changes will take place in the March sign-up:

- Schedule changes to lines 29 and 72R.
- Line 12 northern terminal changed to Harrison and 5<sup>th</sup> with the final in-service stop at Gilman and 6<sup>th</sup>.
- Line 57 terminal will be temporarily moved to La Coste and 65<sup>th</sup> in Emeryville to accommodate construction activities at Emeryville Public Market.

#### **6. Update on Regional Measure 3 (RM3)**

Estee Sepulveda, Legislative Affairs & Community Relations gave an update on Regional Measure 3. Regional Measure 3 (RM3) is a measure on the June 5, 2018 ballot in the nine-county San Francisco Bay Area. The measure is a plan to build major roadway and public transit improvements via an increase in bridge tolls on all Bay Area toll bridges except the Golden Gate Bridge. RM3 was authorized by the State Legislature by Senate Bill 595 (authored by Senator Jim Beall of San Jose) and signed into law by Governor Edmund G. Brown, Jr. in 2017. The goal of RM3 is to reduce traffic congestion and improve transportation options throughout the San Francisco Bay Area's state-owned toll bridge corridors. Measure will be administered by the Bay Area Toll Authority (BATA).

#### **AC Transit Funding**

- **Regional Express Bus**

\$20 million in operating funds are available. Language in the project description for "Regional Express Service" specifies that these funds will be allocated in proportion to Transbay bus ridership.

- **Core Capacity Transit Improvements**

\$140 million will be distributed. Language in the project description for "Core Capacity Transit Improvements" states that funds are for AC Transit Tier 1 and Tier

2 projects, which includes new buses, a new bus facility, and other priority improvements required to expand Transbay service.

- **AC Transit - Rapid Bus Improvements**

\$100 million funding commitment for AC Transit - Rapid Bus Improvements to make transformative improvements for ridership levels and congestion relief.

RM3 proposes a toll increase of \$1 in 2019, \$1 in 2022 and \$1 in 2025. Subject to voter approval of RM3, BATA would be allowed to adjust the RM3 portion of the tolls to account for inflation after the RM3 toll increase is fully phased in.

Voter approval would affect toll rates on the Bay Area's seven state-owned toll bridges, which include the Antioch Bridge, the Benicia-Martinez Bridge, the Carquinez Bridge, the Dumbarton Bridge, the Richmond-San Rafael Bridge, the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge and the San Mateo-Hayward Bridge. Tolls on the Golden Gate Bridge would not be affected as it is owned and operated by an independent district not overseen by BATA.

Based on current traffic volumes, each dollar generates approximately \$125 million in annual toll revenue. The RM3 Expenditure Plan identifies projects that would be funded if voters improve a toll increase of \$3 over six years. The annual revenue would be used to finance a \$4.5 billion slate of highway and transit capital improvements along with \$60 million annually to provide new bus and ferry service in congested bridge corridors and improved regional connectivity at the future Transbay Terminal.

## **7. Chair's Report**

Robson reported that the City of Oakland Public Works department has been installing temporary bus islands on 24<sup>th</sup> and 27<sup>th</sup> and Telegraph Avenue. These boarding islands are platforms separated from the sidewalk by a bike lane and allow transit vehicles to remain in the travel lane while picking up and dropping off passengers. Robson encouraged Committee members to go experience these structures for themselves.

## **8. Board Liaison Report**

H. E. Christian Peeples, AC Transit Board of Directors, reported on the following items:

- The Board approved the Transbay Fare Schedule effective July 1, 2018.
- UC Davis held a two day conference on 3 Revolutions: Electrocution, Automation and Shared Vehicles. The Board of Directors will discuss this more at a closed August 2018 Board Retreat and how it has an impact on fixed route transit.

## **9. Review of Lift/Ramp Road Call Report**

The Committee reviewed the report for the period of February 4 – March 3, 2018. Of the 4 lift/ramp road calls; none were chargeable.

**10. Service Review Advisory Committee (SRAC) Report**

The SRAC Meeting was held March 6, 2018. The Committee reviewed and approved the FY 18/19 Measure B/BB Paratransit Plan and Funding Application. The Committee also approved Staff's recommendations on East Bay Paratransit's (EBP's) current No-Show/Late Cancellation Policy. The next SRAC meeting will be held May 2, 2018 at 12:30 pm at EBP, 1750 Broadway, Oakland.

**11. Alameda County Transportation Commission (ACTC) PAPCO Report**

None.

**12. Public Comments**

None.

**13. Member Communications and Announcements**

- Clutts requested demographics of AC Transit ridership.
- Chew stated that the Customer Service Center has not provided professional services to clients at the G.O.
- Chew also shared two community events sponsored by USOAC:
  - March 26, 2018 – Town Hall Meeting, Bus Stop Signs for Everyone – help your community raise awareness about AC Transit signage in Downtown Oakland and Chinatown
  - May 25, 2018 – 27<sup>th</sup> Annual Convention – Empowering seniors

**14. Staff Communications and Announcements**

Priority Seating/Signage Sub Committee will meet on April 10, 2018 at 11:30a.m., prior to the AAC meeting.

**15. Set Next Agenda & Meeting Date**

The next AAC Meeting will be held Tuesday, April 10, 2018 at the East Bay Paratransit Office, 1750 Broadway, Oakland, in the Community Room. Agenda items will include an Election of Chair/Vice Chair and Review of AAC Priorities.

**16. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 3:00 p.m.

**ATTACHMENT 1  
DRAFT MINUTES  
REGULAR MEETING OF THE AC TRANSIT  
ACCESSIBILITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE (AAC)  
APRIL 10, 2018**

The meeting was called to order at 1:04 p.m.

**1. Roll Call and Introduction of Members and Guests**

**AAC members present:**

Chonita Chew	Mary Clutts
Shirley Cressey	Pam Fadem
Don Queen	James Robson, Chair
Will Scott	Tanya Washington
Barbara Williams	Hale Zukas

**AAC members absent:**

Janet Abelson (excused)	Saleem Shākir Gilmore (resigned)
Maureen Gilhooly (excused)	Jim Gonsalves

**Staff:** Tammy Kylo, Administrative Coordinator  
Kim Ridgeway, Accessible Services Specialist  
Mallory Nestor-Brush, Accessible Services Manager

**Guests:** H. E. Christian Peeples, Board of Directors  
Arnold Brillinger, Chair, Service Review Advisory Committee (SRAC)

**2. Order of Agenda**

The order of agenda was approved.

**3. Approval of Minutes**

MOTION: Scott/Robson approved the March 13, 2018 AAC meeting minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

AYES – 9: Chew, Clutts, Cressey, Queen, Robson, Scott, Washington, Williams, Zukas

ABSTENTIONS – 1: Fadem

ABSENT – 4: Abelson, Gilhooly, Gilmore, Gonsalves

**4. Election of Chair/Vice Chair**

Mallory Nestor-Brush, Accessible Services Manager, opened nominations for AAC Chair for 2018-2019.

Cressey nominated Fadem.

Robson nominated Williams.

6 for Fadem, 4 for Williams

**Pam Fadem elected Chair of the AAC for 2018-2019**

Mallory Nestor-Brush, Accessible Services Manager, opened nominations for AAC Vice-Chair for 2018-2019.

Fadem nominated Williams

No other nominations

All approved; carried unanimously

**Barbara Williams elected Vice Chair for the AAC for 2018-2019**

## **5. Review AAC Priorities**

The Committee discussed the current Top Priorities and briefly discussed additional priorities.

**MOTION:** Robson/Queen moved to have the following bullet point added to the priorities: “Support and participate in customer service training for both phone and in-person customer service staff to ensure respectful, accessible, and appropriate information and service for seniors, people with disabilities and all riders on AC Transit.” The motion carried by the following vote:

AYES – 9: Chew, Clutts, Cressey, Fadem, Queen, Robson, Washington, Williams, Zukas

ABSTENTIONS –1: Scott

ABSENT – 4: Abelson, Gilhooly, Gilmore, Gonsalves

**MOTION:** Scott/Clutts moved to accept all five AAC Top Priorities.. The motion carried unanimously:

AYES – 9: Chew, Clutts, Cressey, Fadem, Queen, Robson, Scott, Washington, Williams, Zukas

ABSENT – 4: Abelson, Gilhooly, Gilmore, Gonsalves

## **6. Priority Seating/Messaging Sub-Committee Report**

Pam Fadem reported on the discussion of the Priority Seating Sub-Committee. The Sub-Committee proposed an outreach campaign of positive messages on the interior and exterior of the bus that would say “Please Make Room” or “We All Ride Together”. These messages will include photos of all “priority riders”, be in multiple languages and include pictograms. The next meeting will take place on May 8th at 12:00 pm.

**7. Chair's Report**

Robson thanked AC Transit Staff for their support of him as Chair of the Committee for the past two years.

**8. Board Liaison Report**

H. E. Christian Peeples, AC Transit Board of Directors, reported on the following items:

- The Public Hearing for the Transbay Tomorrow Service Plan took place on March 28, 2018. A decision will be made at the April 25, 2018 Board of Directors meeting
- The new Transbay Terminal is scheduled to open October 2018.
- BRT is set to start revenue service December 2019.

**9. Review of Lift/Ramp Road Call Report**

The Committee reviewed the report for the period of March 4 – March 31, 2018. Of the 4 lift/ramp road calls; 2 were chargeable.

**10. Service Review Advisory Committee (SRAC) Report**

Mallory Nestor-Brush, Accessible Services Manager, reported that at the SRAC meeting was held on March 6, 2018. The Committee reviewed and approved the FY 18/19 Measure B/BB Paratransit Plan and Funding Application. The Committee also approved Staff's recommendations on East Bay Paratransit's (EBP's) current No-Show/Late Cancellation Policy. The next SRAC meeting will be held May 2, 2018 at 12:30 pm at EBP, 1750 Broadway, Oakland.

**11. Alameda County Transportation Commission (ACTC) PAPCO Report**

None.

**12. Public Comments**

Arnold Brillinger stated that he's been getting great customer service from Bus Operators, including nice words as he disembarks the bus.

**13. Member Communications and Announcements**

- Pam Fadem thanked Jim Robson for his kindness, leadership and inclusiveness as AAC Chair.
- Chonita Chew reminded the AAC about May 25, 2018 – 27th Annual Convention – Empowering seniors.
- Mary Clutts asked for more data on Seniors who ride AC Transit verses number of Seniors in the AC Transit service area.

**14. Staff Communications and Announcements**

None.

**15. Set Next Agenda & Meeting Date**

The next AAC Meeting will be held Tuesday, May 8, 2018 at the East Bay Paratransit Office, 1750 Broadway, Oakland, in the Community Room. Agenda items will include a Review of Customer Service training and June Service Changes.

**16. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 2:16 p.m.